



Members

Kevin Bartoy, Chair
Ken House, Vice-Chair
Roger Johnson
Jennifer Mortensen
Alex Morganroth
Lysa Schloesser
Holly Stewart
Carol Sundstrom
Jeff Williams
Marshall McClintock, North Slope Ex-Officio

MINUTES

**Landmarks Preservation Commission
Planning and Development Services Department**

Staff

Reuben McKnight, Historic Preservation Officer
Lauren Hoogkamer, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Amylena Figueroa, Office Assistant

Date: January 23, 2019
Location: 747 Market Street, Tacoma Municipal Building, Room 243

Commission Members in Attendance:

Kevin Bartoy, Chair
Ken House
Roger Johnson
James Steel
Holly Stewart
Carol Sundstrom
Jeff Williams
Jennifer Mortensen
Alex Morganroth
Marshall McClintock

Staff Present:

Reuben McKnight
Amylena Figueroa

Others Present:

Jennifer Keating
Nancy
Michael Solen
Michael Tipton
Erich Petschke

Commission Members Absent:

Lysa Schloesser

Chair Kevin Bartoy called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

1. ROLL CALL

2. CONSENT AGENDA

3. NAMING REQUESTS – PUBLIC HEARING

A. Puyallup River Bridge/Eells Street, Fishing Wars Memorial Bridge/Fishing Wars Memorial Crossing

4. NOMINATION TO THE TACAOM REGISTER – PRELIMINARY REVIEW

A. 5210 South State Street, White, Shield Home

5. DESIGN REVIEW

A. 1116 Martin King Jr. Way, Kellogg-Sicker Building (Individual Landmark) *Sign*

B. Adj. 565 Broadway, Spanish Stairs (Old City Hall Historic District) *Planting Design*

6. CHAIR COMMENTS

3. Mr. McKnight read the staff report.

NAMING REQUESTS—PUBLIC HEARING

Pursuant to Council Resolution 38091, the Landmarks Preservation Commission reviews and makes recommendations to City Council on name change requests.

The purpose of this public hearing is to receive comments on this naming request. Following this public hearing the public record will be open for 30 days minimum to allow for additional comment. After the comment period, the Landmarks Preservation Commission will forward a recommendation to City Council for further review.

AGENDA ITEM 3A: Puyallup River Bridge/Eells Street, Fishing Wars Memorial Bridge/Fishing Wars Memorial Crossing

Alisa O'Hanlon, City of Tacoma & Jennifer Keating, Puyallup Tribe of Indians

BACKGROUND

The City of Tacoma and the Puyallup Tribe of Indians are requesting to name the bridge—which extends from Puyallup Avenue across the Puyallup River to Fife—the Fishing Wars Memorial Bridge and to name the roadway—which crosses the bridge—the Fishing Wars Memorial Crossing. These name changes would recognize the Puyallup Tribe's historic and ongoing ties to this location. The bridge is located within the boundaries of the Puyallup Reservation, which is near multiple historic Puyallup village sites. It is above the Ceremonial Grounds used for the First Fish Ceremony. The bridge is also the site of some of the most intense events of the Fishing Wars. Recognition of the site and event is part of the reconciliation between the Tribe and the City. The bridge will also have interpretive signage that includes the Twulshootseed name and an explanation of the historic significance of the site. On October 2, 2018, the Tacoma City Council adopted Resolution N. 401222 to initiate the renaming process. Adjacent properties owners were notified and public comment was taken.

On December 12, 2018, the Landmarks Preservation Commission voted to schedule the request for a public hearing.

ACTION REQUESTED

There is no action required. The comment period will remain open for 30 days following the close of this hearing.

Jennifer Keating, Puyallup Tribe of Indians, and Nancy Shipentire noted that this is part of a greater language revitalization effort. They now have a dedicated language department to revitalize the efforts. She had Nancy come to talk about the fishing wars. She was 8 when her father was jailed for illegal fishing. The women still needed to take care of their children and families. They waited until the exact minute to let the men out of jail. She noted that growing up she would travel with the salmon to go fishing. She noted that the tribe fought for the treaty rights, and reviewed certain celebrities that had been thrown in jail as well. She noted that the school system do not educate non-tribal members well enough. The four treaties that had been signed between the US and the tribe have all been broken, and other cultures that had treaties with the US that had also been broken. The fishing wars were the first time the tribe had been physically attacked. She showed pictures of some of the members during the time of the wars, and how they had let the cops physically attack the members. She noted they were harassed at school, and also at their own homes. The worst part of the war were the 60 people that were shot. She would like better education about the tribe to the community. She had said that other tribes wanted to contact her tribe for inspiration when fighting for the treaty rights again. She noted that even today, they are still fighting for the fishing rights, and now it's on the table. She talked about the environment that is fading. She noted that her people are never showed on the news, and people need to be educated. She related some stories about childhood memories of the fishing, and how large the salmon were. She noted that unless you're not in this movement, you're not aware of what is truly going on. She noted that greed has taken over and there will be hardship coming regarding food shortages and having to fight for food.

Commissioner Williams asked if there is anyone still alive from that movement.

Nancy mentioned a couple of names, along with her brother Don McCloud, but he has a lot of anger toward this and it is difficult for him to talk about this. There's not that many younger people in the tribe that remember the Fishing Wars.

There were no public comments about the naming. The 30 day comment period will be open until February 22nd.

4. Mr. McKnight read the staff report.

AGENDA ITEM 4A: 5210 South State Street, White Shield Home

Susan Johnson, Artifacts Consulting

BACKGROUND

Designed by George W. Bullard and Hull and built by C. L. Meeker in 1916, this Colonia Revival building was originally a White Shield Home maternity ward for unwed mothers. The White Shield Home is nominated under Criterion A for its significant contributions to the development of Tacoma and also under Criterion B for its association with the work of two of Tacoma's pioneering women physicians -- doctors Ella J. Fifield and Eva St. Clair Osborn. Originally constructed as a maternity home for unwed mothers, the home was a refuge to women marginalized by social mores of the Victorian-era. Doctors Fifield and Osborn, although known for their strong stance on prohibition, played important roles in championing women's causes in Tacoma and the nation. Tacoma's first White Shield maternity home for unwed mothers was founded in 1889 by Dr. Eva St. Clair Osborn. She and her pioneering colleague, Dr. Ella J. Fifield, were two of the first five licensed women to practice medicine in the City of Tacoma.

The building was recently purchased with the intent of converting into an assisted living facility, which will require the Historic Conditional Use Permit. The owner also intends to apply for the Special Tax Valuation incentive for the rehabilitation work, which will include restoring the historic brick masonry portion of the property and demolishing the contemporary single story annex on the front(east) side of the structure. The front façade of the building will also be restored and a new annex will be built on the south side. These changes will go through design review with the Landmarks Preservation Commission. A schematic plan has been included as an informational item.

The property is nominated under the following criteria:

- A. Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or*
- B. Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past;*

REQUESTED ACTION

Determination of whether the property nominated to the Tacoma Register of Historic Places appears to meet the threshold criteria for nomination, and if so, scheduling the nominations for public hearing. The commission may forward all or part of the nomination for future consideration.

EFFECTS OF NOMINATION

- Future changes to the exterior will require approval of the Landmarks Preservation Commission prior to those changes being made, to ensure historical and architectural appropriateness.
- Unnecessary demolition of properties listed on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places is strongly discouraged by the municipal code, and requires approval of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.
- Future renovations of listed on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places may qualify for the Special Tax Valuation property tax incentive.
- The property will become eligible for the Historic Conditional Use Permit.

STANDARDS

The threshold criteria for Tacoma Register listing are listed at 13.07.040B(1), and include:

1. Property is at least 50 years old at the time of nomination; and,
2. The property retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association such that it is able to convey its historical, cultural, or architectural significance.

ANALYSIS

1. At 103 years-old the property meets the age threshold criterion.
2. This property retains a fair degree of overall integrity; however, original materials such as doors, windows and the original clay tile roof have been lost. The building was also remodeled in 1957 and 1959, at which point the addition was added and the original entrance was lost. A less formal entrance and staircase was then added to the north side. However, the building retains its overall form and represents a unique historical narrative in the City of Tacoma and South Tacoma.
3. The owner intends to complete a rehabilitation according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards

RECOMMENDATION

Recommended language for scheduling a public hearing:

*I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission adopt the analysis as findings and schedule the **5210 South State Street, White Shield Home**, nomination for a public hearing and future consideration at the meeting of February 13, 2019.*

Recommended language for declining to schedule a public hearing for one or more components of the nomination:

*I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission find that [cite specific elements or properties that should be excluded] do not meet the threshold criteria (describe) and deny the nomination for **5210 South State Street, White Shield Home**.*

Recommended language for deferral:

*I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission defer consideration of the nomination for **5210 South State Street, White Shield Home**, [cite specific elements or properties for which additional information is needed] so that additional information (specify) can be presented for consideration to the Commission.*

Michael Solen noted that he thought it would be important to hear from her about the plans for the home. He wanted to speak about the history of the home. He noted that there's few sites associated with women's history.

In the 1960's, Tacoma was a hotbed for women's issues and women's suffrage. In 1910 women had the right to vote in Tacoma, a decade before it was nationally recognized. He spoke about some brief history of Emma Dovough. The building and the grounds itself are significant in the city's history. Additions have been made that have camouflaged the original masonry of the building but it's still very similar to the original. Mr. Solen continued briefing the Commission about further details of Tacoma and the home's history. The windows are still original.

After some brief discussion between the Commissioners, Mr. McKnight noted that the city very much wants to see the building rehabilitated. He is encouraging people to consider the historical conditional use permit. As this process goes forward, they will schedule a public hear for comments. He continued to discuss the process and he can schedule a meeting with her and the planning staff to go over this building. He noted that there is already support for this building to a support in the community.

Commissioner Williams noted that putting the house on the register is more pertinent than getting a conditional use permit. McClintock noted that there will be a lot of neighborhood support for this home as well.

Commissioner Williams made a motion.

"I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission adopt the analysis as findings and schedule the 5210 South State Street, White Shield Home, nomination for a public hearing and future consideration at the meeting of February 13, 2019."

There was a suggestion that part of the nomination will reflect demolition of the 1950s addition, and also criteria C will be added.

Commissioner Mortensen seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously.

Discussion ensued regarding the criteria and renovation for the home. Mr. Solen also wanted to note that it was an honor to have Nancy here tonight. He has been in and out of the LPC meeting for 30 years and hasn't once recalled the tribe and the city working together on a cooperative project. He was in awe of her story, and is in full support of the bridge.

5. Mr. McKnight read the staff report.

AGENDA ITEM 5A: 1116 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, Kellogg-Sicker Building (Individual Landmark)

Tracie Skiles, Berry Sign Systems

BACKGROUND

Built in 1906, this is an individual landmark on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places. This proposal is for one 2'-6"x3' black blade sign. The sign will have white letters that read "ZODIAC SUPPER CLUB," these letters will have red LED illumination at night. The sign will be mounted above the window. The building has recently been rehabilitated after many years of deferred maintenance, and as a part of the renovation, new storefronts were constructed based on the historical architectural plans.

ACTION REQUESTED

Approval of the above scope of work.

STANDARDS

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings

9. New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

ANALYSIS

1. This property is an individual landmark on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places, as such, it is subject to review by the Landmarks Preservation Commission pursuant to TMC 13.05.047 modifications.
2. The sign is compatible in size and scale.
3. No historic material is being destroyed or removed. The sign could be removed without harming the building or its character defining features.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application.

Recommended language for approval:

I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the application for 1116 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, as submitted.

Recommended language for deferral:

I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission defer the application for 1116 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, pending submittal of [cite additional information needed to review application].

Recommended language for denial:

I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission deny the application for 1116 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, based on the following [cite design guidelines.]

Michael Tipton from Barry signs noted that when the owner of the Zodiac Supper Club called him, neither him nor I knew this was a historic building. He noted that looking back, he doesn't think he would've designed the sign any differently knowing that is a historic building. He enjoys designing signs that fit the historic era of the buildings. He hopes this meets the guidelines for the commission.

Commissioner Williams made a motion

"I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the application for 1116 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, as submitted."

Commissioner Sundstrom seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. McKnight continued on to read the staff report for agenda item 5B.

AGENDA ITEM 5B: Adj. 565 Broadway, Spanish Stairs (Old City Hall Historic District)

Erich Petschke, McMenamins Inc.

BACKGROUND

Built in 1915 this is a contributing property in the Old City Hall Historic District. McMenamins is proposing to rehabilitate the landscape into a small public garden with seating and an outdoor dining area. The plans include repairing the irrigation system, preserving mature trees, and replanting the slopes with a variety of plants. A planting schedule and plan have been attached. They are also planning on adding handrails for pedestrian safety. The Commission was briefed on the planting and site plan on November 10, 2010 and January 26, 2011. In 2012, and the seating and handrails were approved and again as an administrative review in 2018. The minutes are included from those meetings.

ACTION REQUESTED

Approval of the above scope of work.

STANDARDS

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings

9. New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

ANALYSIS

1. This property is contributing property in the Old City Hall Historic District, as such, it is subject to review by the Landmarks Preservation Commission pursuant to TMC 13.05.047 modifications.
2. No historic material is being destroyed or removed. The proposed landscaping is compatible with the environment of the historic property.
3. The landscaping could be removed without harming character defining features.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application.

Recommended language for approval:

I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the application for the Spanish Stairs, as submitted.

Recommended language for deferral:

I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission defer the application for the Spanish Stairs, pending submittal of [cite additional information needed to review application].

Recommended language for denial:

I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission deny the application for the Spanish Stairs, based on the following [cite design guidelines.]

Mr. Petschke has been gardening for McMenamins for 20 years. He noted this is a beautiful gem of the city. They are not just going these steps though, they are beautifying other neighboring plots as well. He wanted to choose plants that would not take away from the steps, but would reflect a blend of PNW and European style. He wanted to also choose plants that would not require a ton of maintenance or chemicals. He wants to treat this as a formal space that's in tune with the natural plants around it.

Commissioner Williams asked about the monkey puzzle tree. Eric gave an overview of the history of the tree. It was most likely planted there in 1905.

Mr. Petschke noted there won't be any grade changes or moving soil other than what will be with the irrigation and removal of the plants.

Commissioner McClintock asked about the eucalyptus tree – and was concerned about the coldness of the state. Mr. Petschke noted that there are tons of eucalyptus trees that range from needing warmth and that can handle the cold. This particular type will grow in more width than height wise. The opening will be in April 24th.

Discussion ensued.

Commissioner house made a motion

“I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the application for the Spanish Stairs, as submitted.”

Commissioner Johnson seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

6. CHAIR COMMENTS

None.

Meeting adjourned at 7pm.

**These minutes are not a direct transcription of the meeting, but rather a brief capture. For full-length audio recording of the meeting, please visit: <http://www.cityoftacoma.org/cms/One.aspx?portalId=169&pageId=67980>*